

JOURNAL OF EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN ARCHAEOLOGY AND HERITAGE STUDIES



THE PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY PRESS

VOL. 5 NO. 1 2017





EDITORS

Ann E. Killebrew, *The Pennsylvania State University, University Park (USA)*

Sandra A. Scham, *The Catholic University of America (USA)*

ASSISTANT EDITORS

Hanan Charaf, *Lebanese University (Lebanon)*

Louise A. Hitchcock, *University of Melbourne (Australia)*

Justin Lev-Tov, *Cogstone Resource Management, Inc. (USA)*

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

Mitch Allen, *Mills College (USA)*

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Gabriele Faßbeck, *University of Alabama (USA)*

EDITORIAL AND ADVISORY BOARD

Salam Al-Kuntar, *University of Pennsylvania (USA)*

Lorenzo d'Alfonso, *New York University (USA)*

Jere L. Bacharach, *University of Washington (USA)*

Reinhard Bernbeck, *Freie Universität Berlin (Germany)*

Eric H. Cline, *The George Washington University (USA)*

Anastasia Dakouri-Hild, *University of Virginia (USA)*

Elif Denel, *American Research Institute in Turkey, Ankara (Turkey)*

Ioannis Georganas, *Independent Researcher (Greece)*

Joseph A. Greene, *Harvard University (USA)*

Matthew Harpster, *Institute of Nautical Archaeology, Bodrum (Turkey)*

Kenneth G. Holum, *University of Maryland, College Park (USA)*

Saleh Lamei, *D. G. Centre for Conservation of Islamic Architectural Heritage (Egypt)*

Mark Leone, *University of Maryland, College Park (USA)*

Thomas E. Levy, *University of California, San Diego (USA)*

Alexander Nagel, *Smithsonian Institution (USA)*

Shelley-Anne Peleg, *Israel Antiquities Authority (Israel)*

Susan Pollock, *Freie Universität Berlin (Germany)*

Issa Jubrael Sarie, *Al-Quds University (Jerusalem)*

Neil A. Silberman, *University of Massachusetts Amherst (USA)*

Stuart Tyson Smith, *University of California, Santa Barbara (USA)*

Sharon R. Steadman, *SUNY Cortland (USA)*

Margreet Steiner, *Independent Scholar (The Netherlands)*

Christopher A. Tuttle, *Council of American Overseas Research Centers (USA)*

James M. Weinstein, *Cornell University (USA)*

Donald Whitcomb, *The University of Chicago (USA)*

Naama Yahalom-Mack, *The Hebrew University of Jerusalem (Israel)*

Front cover photo: Detail of the Pergamon Altar (second century BCE), now in the Pergamon Museum, Berlin. On the eastern side of the gigantomachy frieze Athena seizes the giant Alcyoneus, as Gaia, the mother of the giants, emerges. (Photo by M. Ranta. Courtesy of Wikimedia Commons [https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Athena_and_Nike_fight_Alkyoneus,_Gaia_rises_up_from_the_ground_(5336871341).jpg].)

JOURNAL OF EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN ARCHAEOLOGY AND HERITAGE STUDIES

VOL. 5 NO. 1 2017

FORUM

Artifacts Out of Context: Their Curation, Ownership, and Repatriation

1 Introduction

Ann E. Killebrew and Sandra A. Scham

GENERAL TREATMENTS

6 Museums as Intermediaries in Repatriation

Jack Green

19 Repatriation and the Legacy of Colonialism in the Middle East

Salam Al Quntar

27 Trafficked Lebanese Antiquities: Can They Be Repatriated from European Museums?

Lina G. Tahan

CASE STUDIES

35 Reconciling National and International Interests: The Rockefeller Museum and Its Collections

Beatrice St. Laurent

57 A Complicated Legacy: The Original Collections of the Semitic Museum

Joseph A. Greene

69 Should We Repatriate an On-Campus Archaeological Collection from the Middle East?

Aaron Brody

75 The Palestine Exploration Fund: The Collections of an Historic Learned Society in London

Felicity Cobbing

87 Beyond the UNESCO Convention: The Case of the Troy Gold in the Penn Museum

C. Brian Rose



- 92 Syrian Heritage in Jeopardy: The Case of the Arslan Tash Ivories
Annie Caubet

FUTURE DIRECTIONS

- 101 The Protection of Cultural Heritage Must Be a Collaborative Effort
Deborah Lehr
- 106 In Turkey, Museums Need Reciprocity, Not Only Repatriation
Charles Gates
- 109 Magical Materialism: On the Hidden Danger of Repatriation Disputes
Neil Asher Silberman

BOOK REVIEWS

- 116 *Individuals and Society in Mycenaean Pylos*, by Dimitri Nakassis
Reviewed by Natalie Abell
- 118 *Subjects and Narratives in Archaeology*, edited by Ruth M. Van Dyke
and Reinhard Bernbeck
Reviewed by Mitchell Allen
- 123 *Remembering the Dead in the Ancient Near East: Recent Contributions from
Bioarchaeology and Mortuary Archaeology*, edited by Benjamin W. Porter
and Alexis T. Boutin
Reviewed by Jill Baker
- 127 *Animal Secondary Products: Domestic Animal Exploitation in Prehistoric
Europe, the Near East and the Far East*, edited by Haskel Greenfield
Reviewed by Justin Lev-Tov
- 128 *In Search of Agamemnon: Early Travellers to Mycenae*, by Dudley Moore,
Edward Rowlands, and Nektarios Karadimas
Reviewed by Scott Gallimore
- 130 *In Pursuit of Ancient Cyrenaica: Two Hundred Years of Exploration Set
against the History of Archaeology in Europe (1706–1911)*, by Monika
Rekowska. Translated by Anna Kijak
Reviewed by Susan Kane

THE JOURNAL OF EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN ARCHAEOLOGY AND HERITAGE STUDIES (JEMAHS)

is a peer-reviewed journal published by the Pennsylvania State University Press. *JEMAHS* is devoted to traditional, anthropological, social, and applied archaeologies of the eastern Mediterranean, encompassing both prehistoric and historic periods. The journal's geographic range spans three continents and brings together, as no academic periodical has done before, the archaeologies of Greece and the Aegean, Anatolia, the Levant, Cyprus, Egypt, and North Africa.

As the journal will not be identified with any particular archaeological discipline, the editors invite articles from all varieties of professionals who work on the past cultures of the modern countries bordering the eastern Mediterranean Sea. Similarly, a broad range of topics will be covered including, but by no means limited to:

- Excavation and survey field results;
- Landscape archaeology and GIS;
- Underwater archaeology;
- Archaeological sciences and archaeometry;
- Material culture studies;
- Ethnoarchaeology;
- Social archaeology;
- Conservation and heritage studies;
- Cultural heritage management;
- Sustainable tourism development; and
- New technologies/virtual reality.

Appearing four times a year in February, May, August, and November, the journal will engage professionals and scholars of archaeology and heritage studies as well as non-practitioners and students, both graduate and undergraduate.

In addition to combining traditional and theoretical archaeological data and interpretation, the journal's articles may range from early prehistory to recent historical time periods. It also aims to publish accessible, jargon-free, readable, color-illustrated articles that will be informative for professional and non-professional readers. The journal does not publish unprovenanced artifacts purchased on the antiquities market or objects from private collections.

SUBMISSION INFORMATION

Digital submissions should be sent to: www.editorialmanager.com/JEMAHS. All correspondence should be sent to: Dr. Ann E. Killebrew (aek11@psu.edu). By submitting their work to *JEMAHS*, authors agree to editorial modifications of their manuscripts that are designed to help *JEMAHS* fulfill its mission.

Articles should be submitted as a MS Word file together with all illustrations (1200 dpi for black and white; 600 dpi for grayscale; and at least 300 dpi for color) referenced in the manuscript. Permissions to use photographs and copyrights for all illustrations are the responsibility of the authors and need to be included when the manuscript is submitted. (For more information regarding copyright issues for authors, go to: http://psupress.org/author/author_copyright.html). Papers should be limited to not more than 20–25 manuscript pages or ca. 6,000–7,000 words. Shorter papers are welcome, but authors wishing to submit a paper longer than 25 manuscript pages (including endnotes, references, and appendices) should consult with the editors in advance.

For complete author submission guidelines, please visit:
http://www.psupress.org/journals/jnls_JEMAHS.html

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

The *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology and Heritage Studies* is published quarterly by the Pennsylvania State University Press, 820 N. University Dr., USB 1, Suite C, University Park, PA 16802. Subscriptions, claims, and changes of address should be directed to our subscription agent, the Johns Hopkins University Press, P.O. Box 19966, Baltimore, MD 21211, phone 1-800-548-1784 (outside USA and Canada: 410-516-6987), jrnlcirc@press.jhu.edu. Subscribers are requested to notify the Johns Hopkins University Press and their local postmaster immediately of change of address. All correspondence of a business nature, including permissions and advertising, should be addressed to the Pennsylvania State University Press, journals@psu.edu.

The Pennsylvania State University Press is a member of the Association of American University Presses.

RIGHTS AND PERMISSION

JEMAHS is registered under its ISSN (2166-3548 [E-ISSN 2166-3556]) with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 (www.copyright.com). For information about reprints or multiple copying for classroom use, contact the CCC's Academic Permissions Service, or write to the Pennsylvania State University Press, 820 N. University Dr., USB 1, Suite C, University Park, PA 16802.

Copyright © 2017 by The Pennsylvania State University. All rights reserved. No copies may be made without the written permission of the publisher.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS

In Turkey, Museums Need Reciprocity, Not Only Repatriation

CHARLES GATES

Department of Archaeology, Faculty of Humanities and Letters, Bilkent University

Bilkent 06800, Ankara Turkey; gates@bilkent.edu.tr

In spring 2006, works of the German sculptor Ernst Barlach (1870–1938) were exhibited in Istanbul and Ankara (Fig. 1). I remember my amazement as I walked

among the sculptures placed in the courtyard of the administrative building of the Museum of Anatolian Civilizations, Ankara, a restored Ottoman han. Amazed, because I had never experienced in Ankara an exhibit like this, works of a distinguished foreign artist. Indeed, that exhibit was unique. Although private museums in Istanbul, such as the Sakıp Sabancı Museum and the Pera Museum, have shown art works brought from abroad, museums in Ankara and other Turkish cities, almost entirely state museums, have rarely done so, even with the help of outside institutions (in this case, the Goethe Institute). This is an avenue that needs to be pursued. Although the repatriation of items illegally taken from Turkey deserves support, particularly since the UNESCO



FIG. 1

Ernst Barlach, "Pietà. Project of a War Memorial in Stralsund." A woman holds a dead soldier on her lap. Bronze figure after a plaster model of 1932. (Photo by W. Sauber. Courtesy of Wikimedia Commons [https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:G%C3%BCstrow_Gertrudenkapelle_-_Barlachsammlung_Pieta.jpg].)

conventions of the 1970s, the educative and cultural mission of museums should not stop here but should promote reciprocal arrangements with foreign museums and institutes. The benefits to the Turkish public would be huge (Fig. 2).

The Turkish museum is typically a fortress, a place where objects found in the country are stored and secured. Sources of the objects are typically archaeological excavations, but other provenances can include construction sites, abandoned churches (Orthodox icons painted before the Orthodox-Muslim population exchange, carried out between Greece and Turkey in 1923), abandoned cemeteries (tombstones of Muslims, Christians, and Jews), farm fields, anywhere really.

Highlights of a museum's collection will be displayed for the public. Certain museums have outstanding collections, with many unique items. The Istanbul Archaeological Museum, which contains objects excavated during the late Ottoman Empire in its provinces of Iraq, Lebanon, Syria-Palestine, and Cyprus as well as discoveries from Turkey, Ottoman and Republican, is preeminent. Ankara's Museum of Anatolian Civilizations is key for pre-classical Turkey. Regional museums, developed since World War II at an ever accelerating pace, contain recent finds that can certainly be of great importance, but the range of these museums is local—with

occasional exchanges from other regional museums, although not always identified as such.

Displays tend to be set for a long duration. Updating is infrequent. Objects not used in a display will be condemned to the storerooms, to be seen only by museum personnel or by scholars if they have applied for formal permission from the museum or from the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Directors of ongoing excavations are normally granted access to objects found at their sites, at least during the period an excavation or study season is in progress (usually the summer months). Objects without a pedigree—unpublished or unprovenanced artifacts—languish forgotten or ignored, because the outside researcher has no way to request to see them. The researcher cannot provide the identification needed for this request, because he or she will not have access to the museum inventories, with their numbers.

The focus of most museums is on antiquity. The medieval and early modern world—Byzantine, Seljuk, and Ottoman—is typically a sideline. The so-called “ethnographic museums” serve as repositories for Ottoman objects, such as clothing, other textiles, woodwork, furniture, household possessions (ceramics, embroideries), calligraphy (Quran manuscripts, imperial documents), weapons, and a range of metal objects. Recreations of rooms with mannequins to illustrate



FIG. 2

On a T-shirt designed for a Turkish tour group in Berlin, a young giant on the frieze of the Great Altar, Pergamon, sheds tears of blood for the end of his exile in Germany and his return to Bergama, Turkey. T-shirt designed by Ertan Turgut. (Photo by M.-H. Gates.)

aspects of daily life, such as marriage practices (henna night), are frequently seen.

The large cities, Istanbul, Ankara, and Izmir, have state museums of painting and sculpture, for art of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries that begins with works in the western European styles. Ankara's Painting and Sculpture Museum, for example, is full of paintings in the Impressionist vein. Museums devoted to other subjects exist as well, such as military history (Istanbul's Naval Museum and Military Museum), railroads, toys, etc. Private museums, a phenomenon that took off with the opening of the Sadberk Hanım Museum, Istanbul, in 1980, display not only collections of antiquities and Turkish and Islamic art, core interests here in Turkey, but also modern art of recent decades (such as Istanbul Modern) and, distinctively, the material witness of industrial activities (the Rahmi Koç Industrial Museums, in Istanbul and Ankara) and of business (the Ottoman Bank Museum, housed in SALT Galata, a cultural institution sponsored by Garanti Bank). Other private museums might showcase a writer's home and work, such as the Sait Faik Abasıyanık Museum on Burgaz Island, Istanbul, administered since 1964 by the Darüşşafaka Society, an institution that since 1863 has sponsored education for orphans, or even the Museum of Innocence, established by Orhan Pamuk in 2012 to complement his novel of the same name.

History museums, however, are rare. Nowhere is there a museum of the history of Turkey that might compare in scope, if not scale, with the German Historical Museum in Berlin. Nor are there museums for the comprehensive history of a city, Istanbul or Ankara, say, as exemplified by the Museum of London. Museums focusing on specific events do exist, though, such as the Panorama 1453 History Museum, sponsored by the City of Istanbul, that brings to life the Ottoman conquest of the city. And Ankara has its Liberation War Museum and Museum of the Republic, which consist of the First and Second Parliament buildings, respectively, each administered as a separate museum by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, each with exhibits devoted to the early Republic.

One unusual and particularly successful example of a history museum is the City Museum in Tire, a small city in Aegean Turkey, that opened in 2014. The displays in this museum feature objects that belonged to named people, which give a vivid, personalized sense of life in this city during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

With such a list you might think the museum scene in Turkey is lively and engaging. In Istanbul, yes. Elsewhere, more can be done. Shortcomings are many. The state museums of archaeology have a certain sameness about them. The exhibit designs are done by a central team based in Ankara. Explanatory panels, whether in Turkish or English, can be well done and instructive, but they can also be inadequate, leaving the visitor wondering exactly what he has been seeing. Although antiquities are varied, thanks to the many different cultures that flourished in this land, the routine nature of displays of ceramics, for example, dulls the intellect. The ethnographic museums, with their reconstructions of Ottoman life, are particularly repetitive. One can hardly blame the average Turkish person for quickly thinking that he or she has nothing much to learn from visiting a museum. Museums are taken for granted.

In this light, does it really make sense to devote all emotions, energies, and resources to the recovery of looted artifacts? Apart from a matter of pride, and the due punishment of thieves, smugglers, and arrogant collectors, does the Turkish public care if more Bronze Age seals or Greco-Roman figurines are recovered – and put into a museum storeroom? Probably not, but pride and punishment are of course strong motivators.

I would encourage a new, enlarged mission for the museums in this country. Alongside these efforts for repatriation of objects illegally removed, I propose that the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (home of the directorate of state museums) develop cooperation with museums and institutions outside Turkey, in order to exhibit objects and themes from other countries. For example, like the exhibit of the sculptures of Barlach, Turkey should promote exhibits of art works from foreign countries. These exhibits need not aim to show world-famous objects. Instead, with loans of objects from storerooms of foreign museums, lessons can be imparted about different periods of history, different art styles, themes, and human achievement. Here in Turkey, we learn about Turkey. That's fine. But what do we know even about the countries next door? Bulgaria, in ancient, medieval, or modern times? Other countries around the Black Sea? Iraq and Syria? Iran? Greece, even? Turkish objects go to Europe and the USA—recent exhibits include “Europalia Arts Festival—Turkey,” in Belgium (October 6, 2015–January 31, 2016), and “The Golden Age of King Midas,” on Gordion and the Phrygians, at the Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Pennsylvania

(February 13–November 27, 2016). But nothing comparable about cultures outside Anatolia appears in Turkey, apart from exhibits at certain private museums, as noted above.

Some specific proposals:

- The Ministry of Culture and Tourism should appoint a curator for each museum, at least for large and medium-sized museums. The curator will be responsible for the scholarly oversight of a museum's collection: research and publication; the scholarly contents of displays; and education of visitors. The curator should have a PhD in archaeology, art history, history, or another subject relevant to the nature of the museum. The curator should be competent in a major international research language—English (preferred), French, or German—in order to communicate with colleagues abroad.

A major shortcoming of Turkish museums has been the lack of personnel with scholarly qualifications. A career as a researcher in a museum has been virtually impossible, with few exceptions (at the Istanbul Archaeological Museum, for example). As a result, museums are not centers of active research. They do not produce scholarly publications of their holdings and exhibits are intellectually threadbare, often depending on outside help (the excavators, typically).

- Incoming exhibits. They need not be blockbusters; modest in scale is fine. They could include:
 - Photographs, of art works, buildings, places, anything relevant to the theme of the exhibit.
 - Paintings, sculptures, or other objects – items of lesser renown from the storerooms of other museums, foreign and Turkish, but pedagogically useful to illustrate styles, historical periods, or themes.
 - Exhibits should not come to one museum only, but should circulate among museums. This will ensure that all provincial museums have a share in these programs, that Istanbul and other large cities do not monopolize these efforts.
- Outgoing exhibits.
 - Exhibits originating in one museum can be sent to other Turkish cities, as well as abroad.
 - Like the incoming exhibits, they can be modest in scope, and include

- Photographs;
- Objects neglected in storerooms, which can be useful to illustrate styles, periods, and themes.

The aim of this program is to increase the intellectual mission of Turkish museums, bring an international outlook to all museums in order that people throughout the country can learn more about the world outside in both past and present, and bring to the provincial cities a taste of the cultural advantages that Istanbul in particular possesses. The triumphalism felt about an object removed illegally and repatriated after a hard-fought, expensive legal battle should not be an end in itself, but should be an occasion to create new links with foreign institutions that lead to a dynamic exposure to the art, architecture, and history of the entire world.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Magical Materialism: On the Hidden Danger of Repatriation Disputes

NEIL ASHER SILBERMAN

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Coherit Associates LLC; neil.silberman@coherit.com

In an era of globe-girdling resource flows, angry neo-nationalist movements, and increasing inequality between the powerful and the powerless, it's hardly a wonder that demands for the repatriation of cultural property by former colonial subjects from their former colonial overlords (and cultural institutions) have become a hotly debated ethical concern (Nilsson Stutz 2013).¹ Greece's unanswered call for the return of the Parthenon ("Elgin") Marbles from the British Museum (Fig. 1; Beresford 2015) is only the most famous of many; the longstanding demand of the Egyptian government for the repatriation of the famous bust of Nefertiti from Berlin's Neues Museum (Fig. 2; Ikram 2011); Cyprus's ultimately successful claims for the return of Byzantine frescoes looted from Lysi during the 1974 invasion, displayed until 2012 in the Byzantine Fresco Chapel, the Menil Collection, Houston (Fig. 3; Ogden 2015); and the endless wrangles over legal title to the Dead Sea Scrolls