Metal–Insulator Transition and Heterostructure Formation by Glycines Self-Assembled on Defect-Patterned Graphene

F. Ersan,‡ O. Üzenge Aktürk,§,∥ E. Aktürk,*,†,∥ and S. Ciraci*‡

1Department of Physics, 4Department of Electric and Electronic Engineering, and 6Nanotechnology Application and Research Center, Adnan Menderes University, Aydin 09010, Turkey

ABSTRACT: This study unveils critical physical and chemical processes taking place at the interface between an amino acid, glycine, and defected graphene. Although glycine interacts weakly through van der Waals attraction with pristine graphene, it can set rather strong bonding at the close proximity of low-coordinated C atoms of single and triple vacancies and also at the edges of nanoribbons. The adsorption of a glycine molecule first leads to a reconstruction of the defect through a concerted process, which in turn induces magnetic metal–nonmagnetic insulator transition. This way, glycine can be pinned at the defect site with well-defined atomic configuration and electronic structure. In particular, libration frequency of the adsorbed glycine is attributed to significant restoring forces, which is essential for the self-assembly of glycines. Organic overlayer produced by self-assembled glycines on defect-patterned graphene constitutes a junction (heterostructure) with bilateral electronic and optical properties and offers novel device functions from biographene interfaces. These predictions are obtained from first-principles calculations using density functional theory.

INTRODUCTION

Advances in nanoscience and nanotechnology have brought the bio-two-dimensional (2D) material interface and critical physical interactions therein into focus. Recently, the study of this interface has contributed to the characterization of biomolecules and has led to the discovery of biosensors and smart drugs. The large surface area relative to their volumes is the prime reason why 2D materials acquired increasing role in the biointerface research. Graphene is the most popular material because of its extraordinary properties, such as high surface area, excellent mechanical strength, high carrier mobility and thermal conductivity,1 and low Johnson noise.2

Proteins being one of the most crucial ingredient of living organisms contain many amino acids. Present study on the nature of interactions of amino acids with graphene can provide critical information regarding their fixation for in-depth characterization and synthesis of new peptides. Additionally, functional overlayers of amino acids self-assembled on defect-patterned graphene can be realized. Nanowires, heterostructures, and single-photon and single-electron tunneling sources can be constructed in these organic overlayers for biodevices.

Earlier experimental and theoretical studies have been performed to analyze amino acids,3–6 polyamines, steroids, anticancer drugs, and nucleosides.7–11 Among all amino acids, glycine (or Gly, NH₂CH₂COOH) has a special place because Gly acts as an inhibitory neurotransmitter in the central nervous system in brain12 with an estimated concentration of approximately 1 mM in the normal adult brain.13 This concentration increases in high-grade brain tumors.12 Like other amino acids, Gly also has a weak van der Waals (vdW) interaction with pristine graphene.7,14–19 Even Stone–Wales (SW) defected graphene and oxygen atom-decorated graphene give rise to only minute increase to the binding energy of Gly.19 However, it is well-known that twofold coordinated C atoms at the vacancy sites in graphene can readily interact with adspecies.20–26,43 For example, O₂ and OH molecules dissociate into their constituents at the vacancy site of graphene.21,43 Expectantly, low-coordinated C atoms in graphene can be active sites to provide relatively stronger binding of Gly to graphene.

In this paper, we investigate the interaction of Gly molecule(s) with pristine and defected graphene having single vacancy and trivacancy, as well as the edges of ribbons. The binding of Gly to pristine graphene is weak, even if it can increase slightly either with the negative charging or with the coadsorbed H₂O molecules at the close proximity. However, we found that a Gly can induce reconstruction at the vacancy site via rebonding and eventually it can be pinned at the two-folded C atom with a sizeable binding energy. In the course of the adsorption process, the magnetic and metallic substrate can undergo a metal–insulator transition and eventually becomes

Received: April 11, 2018
Revised: June 1, 2018
Published: June 5, 2018
nonmagnetic. Adsorbed GlyS attain significant libration frequencies and well-defined configuration dictated by the restoring forces originating from the chemical bonding with graphene. With the self-assembly properties acquired this way, organic overlayers can be constructed on defect-patterned graphene to form composite structures with bilateral electronic properties.

**COMPUTATIONAL DETAILS**

First-principles spin-polarized plane-wave calculations were carried out within density functional theory using projector augmented-wave potentials, and exchange-correlation potential approximated by generalized gradient approximation using Perdew, Burke, and Ernzerhof functional including vdW corrections in D2 level (D2-G). Other vdW corrections specified as D3-G and BJ were also used for the sake of comparison. Wave functions are expanded in plane-wave basis sets up to electron kinetic energy cutoff of 550 eV. A single Gly bound to the pristine graphene or to a defect site such as single vacancy or trivacancy is modeled by an (8 × 8) periodic supercell in the xy-plane which is stacked along the z-direction with a 15 Å vacuum spacing to avoid interlayer interactions. Brillouin zone integration is performed with a 9 × 9 × 1 k-point mesh, following the convention of Monkhorst and Pack. Ionic relaxation is realized by conjugated gradient method, which optimizes structure without breaking symmetry. All atoms in the supercell are fully relaxed until the force on each atom is less than 1 eV/Å. In addition, maximum pressure on the lattice has been lowered down to 1 kbar. Numerical calculations are carried out by using VASP software.

Thermal stability and desorption of specific structures are tested by ab initio, finite temperature molecular dynamics (MD) calculations. A Nose thermostat was used, and Newtonian equations of motion were integrated through the Verlet algorithm with time steps of 2 fs. To determine the energy barrier between the initial and final configurations, we use climbing image nudged elastic band method. For these calculations, we determined two images, one of them is the initial image of the unrelaxed Gly + graphene system; the other one is the final image of the optimized system. We take into account nine intermediate images with equal intervals between the initial and final states.

The average cohesive energy of Gly is calculated using the expression, $E_{coh} = E_G + E_{\text{int}} - E_G$, in terms of the total energies of constituent atoms and the total energy of Gly. The binding energy of Gly to graphene is calculated by $E_b = E_G + E_{\text{int}} - E_G$, in terms of the total energies of pristine graphene, a free glycine molecule, and glycine adsorbed to graphene, respectively. The binding energy in the physisorption of Gly on pristine graphene is constituted through weak vdW interaction. The contribution of the chemical interaction to the binding energy in physisorption is determined as the difference of energy between the optimized total energies calculated without and with the vdW correction. If the binding of Gly induces a local reconstruction in graphene, the energy involved with it, $E_{\text{int}}$, is subtracted from the binding energies $E_b$ defined above to redefine the binding energy. The rebonding subsequent to the adsorption of Gly at the edges of nanoribbons is a kind of reconstruction and enhances the binding energy dramatically. The reconstruction or rebonding energy is determined by subtracting the total energy of the substrate calculated for its fixed, reconstructed (or rebonded) geometry from the total energy of Gly + substrate calculated for the fully relaxed reconstructed geometry. Because the binding and dissociation energy of Gly on graphene can change depending on the charge state of the molecule, we calculated pulling energy for different charge states. To this end, starting from the equilibrium configuration, the total energy of charged Gly on graphene is optimized as a function of the distance $h$ between them and the charge in different polarities. At each step, the heights $h$ of at least two atoms of the molecule from the substrate are fixed but the remaining structural parameters are fully optimized.

The bonding is analyzed in terms of the total charge density, $\rho(x)$, difference charge densities, $\Delta \rho(x)$, obtained by subtracting charge densities of free substrate and Gly, and $\Delta \rho(x)$ calculated by subtracting the free atom charge densities from $\rho(x)$. The amount of charge transfer between the substrate and Gly is calculated first by subtracting the charge density of the bare, optimized substrate from $\Delta \rho(x)$ and then by integrating the remaining charge on Gly, $Z_{\text{Gly}}$. The difference between the value of lattice integral and the electronic charge of neutral Gly, $Z_{\text{Gly}} + Z_{\text{Gly}}$ sets the value of charge transfer. Here, $\Delta Z > 0$ indicates electron transfer to Gly from the substrate.

The average cohesive energy of Gly is calculated using the expression, $E_{coh} = E_G \{N + E_C[C] + 2E_O[O] + 5E_H[H] - E_G[Gly]$, in terms of the total energies of constituent atoms and the total energy of Gly. The binding energy of Gly to graphene is calculated by $E_b = E_G[\text{graphene}] + E_G[Gly] - E_G[Gly + \text{graphene}]$ in terms of the total energies of pristine graphene, a free glycine molecule, and glycine adsorbed to graphene, respectively. The binding energy in the physisorption of Gly on pristine graphene is constituted through weak vdW interaction. The contribution of the chemical interaction to the binding energy in physisorption is determined as the difference of energy between the optimized total energies calculated without and with the vdW correction. If the binding of Gly induces a local reconstruction in graphene, the energy involved with it, $E_{\text{int}}$, is subtracted from the binding energies $E_b$ defined above to redefine the binding energy. The rebonding subsequent to the adsorption of Gly at the edges of nanoribbons is a kind of reconstruction and enhances the binding energy dramatically. The reconstruction or rebonding energy is determined by subtracting the total energy of the substrate calculated for its fixed, reconstructed (or rebonded) geometry from the total energy of Gly + substrate calculated for the fully relaxed reconstructed geometry. Because the binding and dissociation energy of Gly on graphene can change depending on the charge state of the molecule, we calculated pulling energy for different charge states. To this end, starting from the equilibrium configuration, the total energy of charged Gly on graphene is optimized as a function of the distance $h$ between them and the charge in different polarities. At each step, the heights $h$ of at least two atoms of the molecule from the substrate are fixed but the remaining structural parameters are fully optimized.
Free Glycine Molecule. A free glycine molecule, \( \text{NH}_2\text{CH}_2\text{COOH} \), is characterized through its optimized structural parameters and corresponding average cohesive energy \( \bar{E}_c \), vibration frequencies, ionization potential (IP), electron affinity (EA), and the distribution of the total electronic charge, as well as electronic energy-level diagram with the highest occupied molecular orbital (HOMO) − lowest unoccupied molecular orbital (LUMO) gap as presented in Figure 1. The calculated vibration frequencies are in fair agreement with experimental and theoretical data. The calculated bond lengths are comparable with previous theoretical and experimental results. Gly is a saturated molecule and hence it has a wide HOMO − LUMO gap of \( E_g = 4.59 \) eV (it becomes 6.20 eV with HSE corrections). The present gap value is slightly lower than that of the previous study. One deduces that HOMO states are derived from N and H orbitals, whereas LUMO states originate from 2p-orbitals of C atom. IP and EA are calculated relative to the optimized neutral, anionic, and cationic glycine molecule. These values are in agreement with those reported in a previous study. Notably, constituent N, C, and O atoms are critical ends of the molecule to form bonds with substrates or to join other molecules.

Binding of Gly To Pristine Graphene. Gly is adsorbed (physisorbed) to graphene via weak vdW interaction. The binding configuration corresponding to the strongest physisorption energy, where the molecule takes a lateral orientation relative to the surface of graphene, is described in Figure 2a. The distance between the constituent atoms of Gly and the plane of graphene varies between 2.61 and 3.19 Å. The binding energy \( E_b \) of this lateral configuration ranges from 0.41 to 0.51 eV depending on the vdW correction used in calculations (see Computational Details). Binding energies reported earlier vary between 0.30 and 0.72 eV. The difference charge density \( \Delta \rho_T \) indicates that a small amount of charge is transferred to Gly from graphene. This attributes a minute chemical interaction (80 meV) into the physisorption. Recent works reported 60–90 meV binding energy for Gly on graphene without vdW attraction. The binding of Gly can be manipulated with charge and solvent. The variation of the total energy as one pulls Gly from its equilibrium position on graphene in different charge states is presented in Figure 2b. When negatively charged, the pulling energy increases. This situation is reversed when the system is positively charged. On the basis of this result, one can conclude that the diffusion (or the migration) and even desorption of Gly on graphene can be monitored by charging. Solvent contribution changes the dielectric of the medium and accordingly the binding energy of an amino acid to the surface becomes stronger with coadsorbed solvent. Earlier, it was found that two H\(_2\)O molecules can stabilize a Gly zwitterion by giving at least one vibrational level of the
potential energy minimum. In the present study, we examined the stabilization of Gly on graphene surface by optimizing the total energy with three H$_2$O molecules initially positioned near the active sites of Gly. We found that the three H$_2$O molecules coadsorbed on graphene, as seen in Figure 2c, increase the polarization in Gly; amino nitrogen (NH$_2$) becomes positively polarized, whereas the carboxyl group (COOH$^-$) is negatively polarized. At the end, the binding of zwitterionic glycine to graphene can be slightly stronger (0.14 eV more) in the presence of coadsorbed H$_2$O molecules at the close proximity of Gly.

Gly physisorbed to graphene can also attain libration frequencies for its rotational vibration as whole around three axes. Three libration frequencies of physisorbed Gly are calculated in Figure 2d. Even if they are soft, they can be measured. In particular, when the physisorption configuration varies or a foreign atom or small molecule is attached to Gly, the libration frequencies undergo a change, which can be detected easily. Once the above arguments are extended to other amino acids, their libration frequencies appear to be an important feature (fingerprint) to characterize a particular molecule. These energy versus radian graphs also prove that Gly prefers physisorbed with parallel orientation on graphene.

**Pinning of Gly at Defect Sites.** Weak vdW interaction between Gly and graphene cannot provide the fixation of the molecule on the substrate, rather Gly would diffuse on the substrate or even desorb from graphene under thermal excitations. Therefore, strong binding of Gly is desired for its characterization and self-assembly. In pristine graphene, three sp$^2$-hybrid orbitals oozing from each C atom are saturated and formed strong C–C bonds, which render inertness. Maintaining several advantages of graphene being an ideal biointerface, Gly can be pinned if it is bound to defect sites, such as single vacancy (V), trivacancy (3V), or edges of graphene, and can possess low-coordinated C atoms with unsaturated sp$^2$-bonds.

**Gly Bound To the Edge of Ribbons.** Armchair N-AGNR or zigzag N-ZGNR nanoribbons, with N being the number of C atoms in the unit cell, both are quasi one-dimensional (1D) and both possess a row of twofold coordinated C atoms with one dangling bond at their edges. By attaching one C atom to each twofold coordinated edge atom, one constructs a Klein edge (KE) defect, as also observed experimentally. These nanoribbons are generally planar; the two edges can couple when they are narrow (or N is small).

If Glys approach both edges of 12-ZGNR with their NH$_2$ ends, one H atom of each Gly dissociates and subsequently is rebound to a twofold coordinated C atom. Remaining parts (NHCH$_2$COOH) are bound to nearest low-coordinated C atoms as shown in Figure 3a. Under these circumstances, the binding energy is 4.85 eV for each Gly, which also includes dissociation of an H atom from NH$_2$ and its rebonding to the binding energy is 4.85 eV for each Gly, which also includes dissociation of an H atom from NH$_2$ and its rebonding to the

$\text{E}_\text{bind} = 4.85 \text{ eV/Gly}$

$\mu\text{H} = 0 \mu\text{H}$

Figure 3. Atomic configurations and binding energies ($E_b$) of Gly which are bound to various nanoribbons of graphene through their NH$_2$ ends: (a) Glys are attached to both edges of zigzag nanoribbon 12-ZGNR. (b) Glys are bound to Klein edged zigzag nanoribbon, 12-ZGNR + KE$^1$. (c) Glys are bound to the armchair nanoribbon, 11-AGNR. (d) Glys are bound to Klein edged armchair nanoribbons, 11-AGNR + KE$^2$.

edges of 11-AGNR + KE$^2$. The adsorption of Gly molecules to both edges is followed by the saturation of C atoms by H atoms subsequent to their desorption from Gly, as well as massive reconstruction and bowing of the nanoribbon. Accordingly, the reconstruction and binding energies are calculated to be rather high. Notably, Glys form rows at the edges and significantly modify the electronic structure of bare nanoribbons. In particular, additional bands of the states located at the edges originating from the ordered rows of Glys can occur. It should be noted that the adsorption of Glys at the edges on the same side complies with possible applications because the nanoribbon is normally supported by a substrate from one side, leaving the other side free for adsorption. We found that the ribbon has been bowed following the adsorption, even if Gly molecules are initially placed in the same plane of the nanoribbon. However, one can expect that the planar geometry of the nanoribbon would be maintained if Gly molecules were adsorbed at alternative sides.

**Gly Bound To A Trivacancy.** Trivacancy (3V) in graphene is normally reconstructed, where surrounding C atoms become rebound to minimize the number of unsaturated sp$^2$-bonds. Eventually, there remain only one twofold coordinated C atom with one unsaturated (dangling) sp$^2$-bond, whereas the rest become threefold coordinated. Graphene + 3V treated by an (8 × 8) supercell is a magnetic metal with $\mu = 1.0 \mu_B$ per cell. A Gly attains diverse binding configurations at the 3V site with different binding energies as shown in Figure 4a,b. Most of these configurations have weak bonding with $E_b < 0.6$ eV, except $C_5$ configuration, which involves a strong chemical binding through the unsaturated sp$^2$-bond with $E_b = 1.93$ eV. The graphene + 3V system undergoes a dramatic change after the chemisorption of Gly in $C_5$ configuration as described in Figure 4c; the whole system changes into a nonmagnetic semiconductor with a direct band gap of 0.263 eV, followed by the changes of energy-level diagram of Gly, as well as the peak positions of density of states. The nonmagnetic state of the
system is confirmed by examining the difference of the densities of states of spin-up and spin-down states for all energies. These are metal—insulator and magnetic—non-magnetic transitions, which are critical changes to be utilized in sensor applications. Notably, a second Gly placed at 3V was repelled by the Gly already adsorbed in C5 conformation. This shows that 3V can bind only one Gly strongly.

The libration frequencies of Gly adsorbed to graphene + 3V with C5 configuration became 4−5 times higher as compared to those of Gly physisorbed to pristine graphene. In Figure 4d, libration frequencies ωL calculated along x, y, and z axes indicate significant restoring forces to maintain the adsorbed molecules in ordered geometry, which is essential for their self-assembly behaviors. Even if the thermal stability of the adsorbed Gly of C5 configuration at 300 K is assured by performing ab initio MD simulations of 2 ps, at higher temperatures T > 400 K, the COOH group is dissociated from the system.

**Gly Bound To a Single Vacancy.** The adsorption of Gly at the site of a single (isolated) vacancy (1V) is also mimicked...
using an (8 × 8) supercell. Two types of single vacancy in graphene, that is, symmetric (S-1V) and reconstructed vacancy (R-1V) observed in graphene, are shown in Figure 5a,b. The calculated energy band structures demonstrate that both vacancies are magnetic metals. When placed near 1V in graphene, a Gly is adsorbed to a twofold coordinated C atom surrounding 1V with $E_b = 1.32$ eV by donating electronic charge of $-0.35e$ to graphene from its nitrogen end as shown in Figure 5c. Results of NEB calculations starting from the parallel-oriented Gly, 2.4 Å above S-1V (point A) are presented in the inset in Figure 5c. Initially, S-1V first transforms into R-1V (point B), and then, overcoming a barrier of 0.45 eV (point C), it eventually becomes adsorbed to R-1V as shown by subinsets. This energy barrier is related to the raising of the unsaturated C atom. Like 3V, upon adsorption, bare graphene + 1V, which is a magnetic metal, changes into a nonmagnetic insulator with 0.15 eV band gap. This is an important effect and can easily be detected through conductance measurements and also can be exploited as a detector of Gly. Another adsorption configuration of Gly, in which one H atom dissociates from the O–H bond and subsequently saturates one C atom at the defect site with the remaining part of Gly being physisorbed is shown in the inset in Figure 5c. The dissociation of an H atom from Gly occurs because Gly is initially placed close to the defect site to generate a strong interaction. The weakly bound part, which raises on the surface, has only weak interaction with graphene.

**Self-Assembly of Gly: Junction Formation.** A Gly adsorbed at an isolated defect site of graphene has a well-defined configuration/orientation, which is maintained by the restoring forces driven by its chemical bond. These restoring forces become apparent by significantly high libration frequencies. This behavior is identified as a self-assembly, which is essential for producing ordered organic films on defect-patterned graphene to achieve a composite material from amino acids. Recently, significant progress has been made to create patterned defects on pristine graphene. The fabrication of large graphene sheets with a high-density array of nanoscale holes, called nanomeshes, has been realized. The formation of 1D periodic SW defects on graphene has been reported. Theoretical studies have predicted critical effects of periodically repeating holes on electronic properties.

**1D-Patterned Adsorption.** Quasi 1D, defect-patterned adsorption of Gly on graphene is considered by using 1V created in a cell of 4.94 Å × 17.10 Å. To allow more variational freedom, a supercell is taken to contain two adjacent 1V, whereby rows of 1V are formed in graphene along the x-axis. When free of Gly, this defected substrate is a magnetic metal. Gly molecules approaching to defected graphene in different orientations and through different ends can trigger reconstruction in the substrate. However, when attached to a twofold coordinated C atom of the defect, Gly can form strong chemical bond and cause magnetic and metallic graphene to transform to a nonmagnetic, narrow band gap semiconductor similar to other defect sites. Despite their preset initial configuration, all Glys are reoriented and have the same final configuration but different from the initial one. As a further test of the self-assembly character, the initial configuration of one of four Glys in a larger supercell was changed randomly from the others; nonetheless four of them attained the same configuration upon optimization. This situation provides a strong evidence for the self-assembly of adsorbed Gly.

As shown in Figure 6 (top right-hand corner), self-assembled Glys formed rows (stripes) and hence construct an organic overlayer on graphene. Because of the strong binding of Gly, this organic overlayer persists at room temperature. This self-assembled system can be viewed as a composite material realized through the junction (heterostructure) of Gly overlayer and defected graphene. The density of states projected to the top of the Gly overlayer has a large band gap of 4.21 eV, whereas the band gap revealed from that projected to graphene is rather narrow in Figure 6 (left panel). In principle, it is an insulator–semiconductor junction with well-defined band alignment and exhibits side-dependent, bilateral electronic and optical properties. Calculated bands of the composite system and charge density isosurfaces of states at the band edges in Figure 6 (bottom right-hand corner) demonstrate the side-dependent electronic structure. HOMO and LUMO states are hybridized with graphene bands. Relatively low-dispersion HOMO and LUMO bands imply weak coupling between the atoms of self-assembled Glys.

---

**Figure 6.** Top right-hand corner: The perspective view of Glys self-assembled on a graphene with patterned vacancies forming quasi 1D stripes. Left panel: Density of states projected to Gly overlayer and graphene. The band gaps are shaded and indicate the insulator–semiconductor junction. Zero of energy is set at the Fermi energy, $E_F$. Bottom right-hand corner: Energy band structure of the junction. The narrowest band gap at the graphene side is shaded; the band edges at the Gly overlayer side are shown by the red dotted lines. Band-projected charge density isosurfaces of the bands at the edges of the gap and nitrogen band at $-21$ eV below $E_F$.
CONCLUSIONS

Despite the fact that the interaction between Gly and pristine graphene is weak vdW attraction, twofold coordinated C atoms at the edges of nanoribbons or single- and triple-vacancy sites act as active sites to exchange significant charge with the molecule. This way, a chemical bonding is set between Gly and the substrate, which pins the molecule with a significant binding energy. Pinning of this amino acid on the surface of graphene enables its characterization and is an important step toward the synthesis of new peptides. We note that in all processes outlined above, Gly is generally adsorbed to low-coordinated C atoms with significant binding from its NH2 end; whereas the bonding with graphene at defect sites from other ends is relatively weaker. When bound to the defect site, Gly induces a metal–insulator transition, where the magnetic and metallic substrate changes to a narrow band gap semiconductor. However, this transition does not occur if Gly was bound through weak vdW interaction.

Through pinning at the vacancy site, a Gly attains significant libration frequencies, where the rotation of the molecule as a whole induces restoring force. Accordingly, these restoring forces are strong enough to keep the adsorbed Gly at a well-defined configuration.

Glys self-assembled on the defect-patterned graphene can form an organic thin film (overlayer) with desired decoration and dimensionality. In this paper, we studied quasi 1D stripes of Gly on graphene forming a junction, with one side being a wide band gap insulator and the other side being a narrow band gap semiconductor. Finally, the semiconducting graphene side can be metallized by the chemisorption of alkali metals to graphene between two self-assembled Gly rows. This way a semiconductor–metal junction and hence a Schottky barrier can be attained. It should be noted that not only insulating 1D rows but also 2D meshes of diverse size and geometry can be realized from self-assembled Glys or other amino acids on graphene or on similar monolayer structures to construct bio-2D material heterostructures with novel functionalities.

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Corresponding Authors
*E-mail: ethem.akturk@adu.edu.tr (E.A.).
*E-mail: ciraci@fen.bilkent.edu.tr. Phone: +902562130835-1894. Fax: +902562135379 (S.C.).

ORCID
E. Aktürk: 0000-0002-1615-7841

Notes
The authors declare no competing financial interest.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Authors acknowledge useful discussion with Dr. Urrutu Şeker and Yelda Kadioglu. This research was supported in part by TÜBİTAK (The Scientific & Technological Research Council of Turkey) through TR-Grid e-Infrastructure Project, part of the calculations have been carried out at ULAKBİM computer center. S.C. acknowledges the financial support from the Academy of Science of Turkey TUBA.

REFERENCES


